

Earnings Gap Dynamics Between Highly Educated Immigrants and U.S.-Born Counterparts: The Role of Entry Visa

December 31, 2024

Abstract

The material contained herein is supplementary to the article named in the title, submitted to the Center for Growth and Opportunity at Utah State University.

Tables A1 and A2 below are the complete, detailed versions of Tables 5 and 7 in the main text.

Table A1: Earnings of Immigrants Relative to Natives: Role of Entry Visa

	All Immigrants	Immigrant Visa Entry	Work Visa Entry	Study/Training Visa Entry	Dependent Visa Entry
Cohort of Arrival to the U.S.					
<= 1969	0.352** (0.175)	0.381 (0.248)	0.028 (0.648)	1.245*** (0.379)	-0.365 (0.378)
1970s	0.331** (0.162)	0.306 (0.236)	0.746 (0.568)	1.140*** (0.307)	-0.280 (0.374)
1980s	0.323** (0.153)	0.362 (0.221)	0.586 (0.485)	1.119*** (0.301)	-0.270 (0.353)
1990s	0.347** (0.152)	0.356 (0.221)	0.656 (0.487)	1.106*** (0.301)	-0.108 (0.331)
2000s	0.370** (0.146)	0.449** (0.216)	0.631 (0.470)	1.044*** (0.297)	-0.026 (0.319)
>= 2010	0.405*** (0.144)	0.517** (0.219)	0.705 (0.470)	1.012*** (0.289)	-0.004 (0.320)
Age - natives	0.052*** (0.003)	0.052*** (0.003)	0.052*** (0.003)	0.052*** (0.003)	0.051*** (0.003)
Age squared - natives ($\times 100$)	-0.046*** (0.003)	-0.045*** (0.003)	-0.045*** (0.003)	-0.045*** (0.003)	-0.044*** (0.003)
Age - immigrants	0.048*** (0.007)	0.029*** (0.010)	0.047** (0.022)	0.010 (0.015)	0.064*** (0.015)
Age squared - immigrants ($\times 100$)	-0.054*** (0.007)	-0.035*** (0.011)	-0.053** (0.023)	-0.015 (0.016)	-0.077*** (0.017)
Years since migration	0.012*** (0.004)	0.031*** (0.006)	0.007 (0.010)	0.010 (0.009)	0.013 (0.010)
Years since migration squared ($\times 100$)	-0.005* (0.007)	-0.027*** (0.010)	0.003 (0.028)	0.000 (0.018)	0.005 (0.016)
Highest degree from the U.S.	0.064*** (0.017)	0.148*** (0.026)	0.047 (0.029)	0.047* (0.027)	0.128*** (0.034)
Highest degree					
Master's	0.198*** (0.007)	0.195*** (0.007)	0.191*** (0.007)	0.195*** (0.007)	0.194*** (0.007)
Doctorate	0.352*** (0.010)	0.351*** (0.011)	0.333*** (0.011)	0.341*** (0.010)	0.344*** (0.011)
Professional	0.542*** (0.012)	0.544*** (0.012)	0.542*** (0.012)	0.555*** (0.012)	0.547*** (0.012)
Field of study					
Computer and IT	0.196*** (0.009)	0.176*** (0.010)	0.171*** (0.010)	0.175*** (0.010)	0.181*** (0.010)
Math and stats	0.119*** (0.017)	0.115*** (0.019)	0.118*** (0.019)	0.128*** (0.019)	0.114*** (0.020)
Bio, agriculture, environment	-0.056*** (0.010)	-0.052*** (0.010)	-0.054*** (0.010)	-0.057*** (0.010)	-0.052*** (0.010)
Physics and related	0.059*** (0.016)	0.056*** (0.018)	0.056*** (0.018)	0.059*** (0.017)	0.057*** (0.018)
Social science and related	-0.006 (0.008)	-0.000 (0.008)	-0.002 (0.008)	-0.001 (0.008)	-0.001 (0.008)
Engineering (w/o comp. and IT)	0.226*** (0.007)	0.234*** (0.007)	0.234*** (0.008)	0.225*** (0.007)	0.237*** (0.008)
Other science and engineering-related	0.147*** (0.007)	0.147*** (0.008)	0.144*** (0.008)	0.143*** (0.008)	0.144*** (0.008)
Male	0.129*** (0.006)	0.127*** (0.006)	0.131*** (0.007)	0.128*** (0.007)	0.128*** (0.007)
Married	0.119*** (0.007)	0.124*** (0.007)	0.122*** (0.008)	0.121*** (0.007)	0.124*** (0.008)
Has child(ren)	0.062*** (0.007)	0.063*** (0.007)	0.065*** (0.007)	0.064*** (0.007)	0.066*** (0.007)
English-speaking	0.193*** (0.007)	0.152*** (0.007)	0.240*** (0.007)	0.020 (0.007)	0.154** (0.007)
No. of observations					
Natives	264,966	264,966	264,966	264,966	264,966
Immigrants	74,291	23,293	12,211	24,974	9,148
Total	339,257	288,259	277,177	289,940	274,114
R-squared	0.211	0.211	0.214	0.213	0.210

Note. *** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1; numbers in parentheses are robust standard errors; coefficients are estimated using OLS weighted by survey weights; log of hourly wage adjusted to 2019 dollars is the dependent variable; U.S.-born natives, holders of bachelor's degrees, holders of degrees in non-science and engineering fields, females, and immigrants from non-English-speaking countries are the base groups for cohort of arrival, highest degree, field of study, gender, and English-speaking, respectively; other independent variables that exist in regressions but are not reported are as follows: race, place of birth, physical disability, employer sector, employer size, employer region, self-employed, and year fixed effect (survey year).

Table A2: Earnings of Immigrants Relative to Natives (in Computer and IT): Role of Entry Visa

	All Immigrants	Immigrant Visa Entry	Work Visa Entry	Study/Training Visa Entry	Dependent Visa Entry
Cohort of Arrival to the U.S.					
<= 1969	-0.063 (0.370)	-0.739 (0.708)	2.058*** (0.661)	0.288 (0.444)	-0.795 (0.690)
1970s	0.018 (0.340)	-0.576 (0.693)	1.029 (0.773)	0.174 (0.408)	-0.624 (0.670)
1980s	0.133 (0.321)	-0.398 (0.658)	1.252*** (0.451)	0.230 (0.391)	-0.649 (0.659)
1990s	0.192 (0.321)	-0.314 (0.646)	1.048** (0.416)	0.245 (0.398)	-0.485 (0.643)
2000s	0.294 (0.317)	0.092 (0.606)	1.087*** (0.395)	0.260 (0.395)	-0.623 (0.623)
>= 2010	0.396 (0.317)	0.318 (0.586)	1.134*** (0.395)	0.315 (0.408)	-0.278 (0.673)
Age - natives	0.044*** (0.007)	0.040*** (0.007)	0.040*** (0.007)	0.041*** (0.007)	0.038*** (0.007)
Age squared - natives ($\times 100$)	-0.043*** (0.008)	-0.039*** (0.008)	-0.039*** (0.008)	-0.039*** (0.008)	-0.037*** (0.008)
Age - immigrants	0.032** (0.015)	0.007 (0.029)	-0.008 (0.019)	0.024 (0.020)	0.080*** (0.027)
Age squared - immigrants ($\times 100$)	-0.039** (0.016)	-0.013 (0.032)	0.003 (0.022)	-0.024 (0.021)	-0.109*** (0.032)
Years since migration	0.018** (0.008)	0.064*** (0.023)	0.042*** (0.012)	0.016 (0.013)	0.013 (0.019)
Years since migration squared ($\times 100$)	-0.007* (0.014)	-0.053* (0.033)	-0.105*** (0.037)	-0.036 (0.025)	-0.006 (0.040)
Highest degree from the U.S.	-0.032 (0.026)	0.038 (0.053)	-0.085 (0.053)	-0.058 (0.048)	0.081 (0.083)
Highest degree					
Master's	0.167*** (0.016)	0.158*** (0.019)	0.148*** (0.017)	0.173*** (0.018)	0.166*** (0.019)
Doctorate	0.407*** (0.026)	0.475*** (0.045)	0.418*** (0.040)	0.427*** (0.031)	0.499*** (0.046)
Male	0.155*** (0.018)	0.148*** (0.021)	0.160*** (0.020)	0.154*** (0.019)	0.148*** (0.021)
Married	0.092*** (0.019)	0.099*** (0.021)	0.106*** (0.020)	0.097*** (0.020)	0.099*** (0.021)
Has child(ren)	0.079*** (0.017)	0.085*** (0.020)	0.081*** (0.018)	0.081*** (0.017)	0.093*** (0.019)
English-speaking	0.084* (0.045)	0.029 (0.075)	0.132*** (0.051)	-0.043 (0.100)	0.104 (0.098)
No. of observations					
Natives	13,143	13,143	13,143	13,143	13,143
Immigrants	8,772	2,013	2,272	3,101	1,035
Total	21,915	15,156	15,415	16,244	14,178
R-squared	0.222	0.215	0.239	0.236	0.223

Note. *** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1; numbers in parentheses are robust standard errors; coefficients are estimated using OLS weighted by survey weights; log of hourly wage adjusted to 2019 dollars is the dependent variable; U.S.-born natives, holders of bachelor's degrees, females, and immigrants from non-English-speaking countries are the base groups for cohort of arrival, highest degree, gender, and English-speaking, respectively; other independent variables that exist in regressions but are not reported are as follows: race, place of birth, physical disability, employer sector, employer size, employer region, self-employed, and year fixed effect (survey year).